

7.0 ALTERNATIVES TO THE PROPOSED ACTION

This section discusses alternatives to the proposed action to build a new parking ramp at Lot 76 on the UW-Madison West Campus.

7.1 THE "NO ACTION" ALTERNATIVE

If no action was taken, the parking shortage in the West Campus would be worsened dramatically when the existing surface lots near the hospital are replaced by new buildings. Current hospital employees would be further dissatisfied with the lack of parking, leading to high staff turnover. New faculty and staff employed in the new hospital buildings would also not have adequate parking.

7.2 ALTERNATIVES TO BUILDING A NEW RAMP

7.2.1 Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Options

As noted in the Walker Report (2002), if the Lot 76 parking ramp is not built and the surface parking spaces lost in the hospital development are not replaced, nearly all west campus and hospital employees would have to use alternative transportation. This is not a feasible option for several reasons:

- Hospital employees will become even more dissatisfied with the lack of parking, leading to higher employee turnover.
- The irregular schedule and shift changes of hospital workers make shuttle bus service difficult. This option is addressed further in Section 7.2.2.
- Bicycles and other TDM options are not attractive to hospital workers who start or finish after dark, which is a safety problem, especially during the winter months.

The UW-Madison currently implements TDM and plans to continue pursuing new TDM measures to increase faculty/staff participation from 46 percent to 60 percent (Campus Master Plan, 1996). Based on a transportation survey completed in 2001, the campus estimated then that 49 percent of the faculty/staff utilize some form of TDM. New programs (such as the free faculty/staff bus pass) will undoubtedly increase TDM participation numbers in the pending 2003 survey.

7.2.2 Expanded Remote Shuttle Parking and Shuttles to the West Campus

The UW Hospital currently operates 12-passenger van shuttles from five remote parking lots:

- 50 leased parking spaces at the UW Credit Union.
- 100 leased spaces at the University Hill Farms State Office Building.
- Department of Revenue offices.
- UW West Clinic.
- UW East Clinic.

The remote parking and shuttle service is provided at substantially reduced cost to the employee than the fee for parking near the UW Hospital. Also, new employees who are on the parking waiting list for on-campus parking use the shuttle service.

Madison Metro Route 53 currently provides a.m. and p.m. peak hour express bus service to the hospital from two remote parking areas. This route provides service at 30-minute intervals from 535 Science Drive in the University Research Park and from the Villager Mall on Park Street to the UW Hospital in the morning from 6:00 a.m. to 8:30 a.m.. In the afternoon, service begins at approximately 3:00 p.m. and

ends at 6:00 p.m. in both directions. The travel time from Science Drive in both directions is 8 to 10 minutes. The travel time from the Villager Mall in both directions is 18 to 19 minutes.

Additional remote parking lots with shuttle bus service, either regularly scheduled Madison Metro service and/or a dedicated shuttle bus, could reduce the number of parking spaces needed to be constructed on campus. The existing Metro transfer points were evaluated as possible sites for remote parking. Madison Metro now has four transfer points outside of the downtown square: East, West, North and South. Since none of these sites now provide parking, surface parking lots would need to be constructed. The East Transfer Point was considered too far from the West Campus to be practical for a shuttle lot. Of the existing Madison Metro routes that serve the other three transfer points, the West and North currently have scheduled bus service to the hospital.

7.2.2.1 North Transfer Point

Two Madison Metro routes currently provide service from the North Transfer Point to the UW Hospital. Route 2 provides 30-minute service (scheduled departures) from 5:10 a.m. to 11:25 p.m. and the trip from the North Transfer Point to the UW Hospital takes an average of 37 minutes. Route 28 only operates during the morning and afternoon peak hours (5:30 a.m. to 9:00 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. to 6:30 p.m.) and provides one directional service. During the morning it provides westbound service (from the North Transfer Point to the UW Hospital) and in the afternoon eastbound service (from the UW Hospital to the North Transfer Point). The average headway is 16 minutes and takes only 23 minutes as compared to 37 minutes for Route 2.

The North Transfer Point location is not expected to be feasible as a remote parking location due to a low concentration of UW Hospital employees in the area and the expected trip time, which would be 1.5 to 2.5 times longer than from the West Transfer Point. In a recent survey of UW Hospital employees, only 19 of the 579 respondents to the survey live near the North Transfer Point and indicated that they would ride the shuttle to the hospital. Since these 19 workers cover all shifts and variations of work schedule, a new remote shuttle parking lot at the North Transfer Point is not a viable option at this time.

7.2.2.2 West Transfer Point

Routes 2 and 28 also provide service from the West Transfer Point to the UW Hospital. Route 28 only provides service from the West Transfer Point during hours that would not address the needs of those hospital employees who work evenings or overnight shifts. In the morning it provides service from the hospital to the West Transfer Point and in the afternoon it provides service in the opposite direction.

Route 2 provides all-day service similar to what is provided from the North Transfer Point. There is a bus every 30 minutes in each direction. The trip averages only 16 minutes to/from the West Transfer Point to the hospital.

As outlined in the Walker Report (2002), a 300-space West Transfer Point Shuttle Lot was considered as an alternative to constructing on-campus parking. As indicated in Table 7-1, a West Transfer Point shuttle would provide a cost-effective alternative in alleviating a portion of the West Campus parking demand. However, the limited number of spaces in the remote shuttle lot would not be enough to replace the surface spaces lost due to building construction. A parking structure would still be required on campus to meet the current parking demand.

7.2.2.3 South Transfer Point

Direct transit service is not currently provided from the South Transfer Point directly to the hospital. Because of the lack of existing service, the South Transfer Point was not considered a favorable option

compared to the West or North Transfer Points. As noted above, Route 53 provides peak hour limited stop bus service between the Villager Mall, near the South Transfer Point on Park Street, and the University Research Park, near the West Transfer Point, during the weekdays. The service runs every 30 minutes each way from 6:00 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. and 3:00 p.m. to 5:30 p.m. running through campus and with a stop north of the UW Hospital at the intersection of Walnut Street and Highland Avenue. This allows faculty, staff and hospital workers to utilize the Park-and-Ride lots at the Village Mall and the University Research Park as an alternative to parking on campus. For those employees working shifts outside of the peak morning and afternoon hours, Route 53 from near the South Transfer Point is not a feasible commuting option.

7.3 ALTERNATIVE BUILD SITES

To meet the additional parking needs through 2011, several alternative parking sites were considered. Ten sites and 13 options were evaluated in Walker Consultants' 1999 parking and traffic study. Several alternatives were eliminated due to unavailable land. The sites and options were then narrowed down to two options. The two final option sites are identified in Exhibit 12. The two options are discussed below.

7.3.1 VA Hospital Parking Lot

The existing surface parking lot at the VA Hospital south of the Clinical Science Center Visitor and Patient Ramp was one of two options for a proposed parking ramp. The VA parking lot alternative, identified as Alternative Site "F" on Exhibit 12, consisted of replacing the 250 parking spaces in the existing surface lot with a four-level parking ramp. Under this alternative, two levels of the lot would be below the existing grade of the VA lot, with the lowest level of the parking structure at the same elevation as the existing Clinical Science Center Patient and Visitor Ramp exit drive. UW Hospital employees would walk from the northwest corner of this lower level to the Clinical Science Center.

There would be 1,262 spaces of which 351 would be for the VA Hospital and the remaining 911 spaces for Clinical Science Center employees. Access to the structure for hospital employees would be from a new driveway onto Highland Avenue from parking level two. An exit could also be provided from the lowest level to the Clinical Science Center ramp exit driveway. VA Hospital employees and visitors would have a separate entrance/exit to level three from the existing internal roadway.

The approximate construction cost would be \$16.4 million or \$13,000 per parking space. In addition to the construction cost, the University would have to lease the land for the structure from the VA Hospital and provide free parking for VA Hospital employees. The University would also possibly have to provide no-cost parking for those VA employees displaced during construction.

This alternative was rejected because of cost and scheduling conflicts. As shown in Table 7-1, the construction and operating costs of building the ramp at the VA Hospital site were not as cost-effective as building on Lot 76.

7.3.2 Lot 60/70 Parking Lot

Lots 60/70 and 76 were both looked at as locations for the new ramp. Both locations were viable options due to their proximity to the university medical facilities. The location of the two adjacent lots are identified as Alternative Site "H" on Exhibit 12. Both locations were more than one-quarter-mile from residential areas.

Lot 60/70 was not chosen for aesthetic reasons and to reduce impacts to the view of/from Lake Mendota. By not building the ramp on this site, it also allows for any potential long term academic building needs the campus might have in the future on this site.

TABLE 7-1
FINANCIAL SUMMARY OF ALTERNATE LOCATIONS

Alternative	Parking Construction Cost	Parking Cost Total Space	Total Project Cost (4)(5)	Total Cost Per Added Space	Annual Debt Service (5)	Annual Operating Cost (6)	Net Annual Cost	Net Annual Cost Per Space	Net Annual Cost Per CSC Added Space	Footnotes
Parking Alternatives										
F	\$16,359,000	\$13,000	\$22,149,000	\$21,900	\$1,931,051	\$504,800	\$2,435,851	\$1,930	\$2,674	2&3, 4, 5a, 6a, 7c
H	\$14,109,840	\$11,000	\$17,637,000	\$21,100	\$1,537,674	\$385,500	\$1,923,174	\$1,497	\$2,300	2, 5a, 6a, 7b
	\$121,440	\$2,800	\$140,000	\$3,300	\$12,206	\$3,225	\$15,431	\$359	\$359	1, 5b, 6a, 7d
	\$14,231,280	\$10,700	\$17,777,000	\$20,200	\$1,549,880	\$388,725	\$1,938,605	\$1,460	\$2,205	
	\$768,000	\$2,600	\$883,000	\$2,900	\$119,971	\$22,500	\$142,471	\$475	\$475	1, 5b, 6b, 7d
Shuttle Option										
West Transfer Point Shuttle (2)						\$104,000	\$104,000	\$347	\$347	
					Total Shuttle Cost	\$126,500	\$246,471	\$822	\$822	
Construction Costs:										
1/New Surface Lot	\$8.00/sq. ft.									
2/Open Structure	\$36.00/sq. ft.									
3/Below Grade Structure	\$54.00/sq. ft.									
4/VA Site Lease Cost	\$1,700,000 Lump sum up front cost									
5/a) Plus Soft Costs @	25% Construction + Development Cost for Parking Structure									
b) Plus Soft Costs @	15% Construction + Development Cost for Surface Lot									
6/Annual Debt Service	a) Structure @ 6.00% for 20 years									
	b) Lot @ 6.00% for 10 years									
7/Operating Costs	a) Above Grade Attended \$450/space/year									
	b) Above Grade Unattended \$300/space/year									
	c) Below Grade Unattended \$400/space/year									
	d) Surface Lot Unattended \$75/space/year									

Note: The project costs do not include soil conditions, environmental abatement expenses, and/or land acquisition costs.

Source: Walker (2003)

7.4 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The Lot 76 ramp will provide 1,285 spaces, 374 more than the 911 spaces that would become available at the VA site. Also, the stalls in the VA ramp assigned to VA employees would not generate revenue. Thus, the Lot 76 location was chosen as the best alternative to replace the existing surface parking within the Highland Avenue "ring road". This location is more cost-effective than building the ramp at the VA Hospital and a better option aesthetically than the Lot 70 location.